

**SUBCHAPTER F: REQUESTS FOR RECONSIDERATION OR
CONTESTED CASE HEARING**

**§§55.200, 55.201, 55.203, 55.205, 55.209 - 55.211
Effective August 29, 2002**

§55.200. Applicability.

This subchapter applies only to applications filed under Texas Water Code, Chapter 26 or 27 or Texas Health and Safety Code, Chapter 361 or 382 that are declared administratively complete on or after September 1, 1999.

Adopted September 29, 1999

Effective October 20, 1999

§55.201. Requests for Reconsideration or Contested Case Hearing.

(a) A request for reconsideration or contested case hearing must be filed no later than 30 days after the chief clerk mails (or otherwise transmits) the executive director's decision and response to comments and provides instructions for requesting that the commission reconsider the executive director's decision or hold a contested case hearing.

(b) The following may request a contested case hearing under this chapter:

- (1) the commission;
- (2) the executive director;
- (3) the applicant; and
- (4) affected persons, when authorized by law.

(c) A request for a contested case hearing by an affected person must be in writing, must be filed with the chief clerk within the time provided by subsection (a) of this section, and may not be based on an issue that was raised solely in a public comment withdrawn by the commenter in writing by filing a withdrawal letter with the chief clerk prior to the filing of the Executive Director's Response to Comment.

(d) A hearing request must substantially comply with the following:

(1) give the name, address, daytime telephone number, and, where possible, fax number of the person who files the request. If the request is made by a group or association, the request must identify one person by name, address, daytime telephone number, and, where possible, fax number, who shall be responsible for receiving all official communications and documents for the group;

(2) identify the person's personal justiciable interest affected by the application, including a brief, but specific, written statement explaining in plain language the requestor's location and distance relative to the proposed facility or activity that is the subject of the application and how and why the requestor believes he or she will be adversely affected by the proposed facility or activity in a manner not common to members of the general public;

(3) request a contested case hearing;

(4) list all relevant and material disputed issues of fact that were raised during the public comment period and that are the basis of the hearing request. To facilitate the commission's determination of the number and scope of issues to be referred to hearing, the requestor should, to the extent possible, specify any of the executive director's responses to comments that the requestor disputes and the factual basis of the dispute and list any disputed issues of law or policy; and

(5) provide any other information specified in the public notice of application.

(e) Any person may file a request for reconsideration of the executive director's decision. The request must be in writing and be filed by United States mail, facsimile, or hand delivery with the chief clerk within the time provided by subsection (a) of this section. The request should also contain the name, address, daytime telephone number, and, where possible, fax number of the person who files the request. The request for reconsideration must expressly state that the person is requesting reconsideration of the executive director's decision, and give reasons why the decision should be reconsidered.

(f) Documents that are filed with the chief clerk before the public comment deadline that comment on an application but do not request reconsideration or a contested case hearing shall be treated as public comment.

(g) Procedures for late filed public comments, requests for reconsideration or contested case hearing are as follows:

(1) A request for reconsideration or contested case hearing, or public comment shall be processed under §55.209 of this title (relating to Processing Requests for Reconsideration and Contested Case Hearing) or under §55.156 of this title (relating to Public Comment Processing), respectively, if it is filed by the deadline. The chief clerk shall accept a request for reconsideration or contested case hearing, or public comment that is filed after the deadline but the chief clerk shall not process it. The chief clerk shall place the late documents in the application file; and

(2) The commission may extend the time allowed to file a request for reconsideration, or a request for a contested case hearing.

(h) Any person, except the applicant, the executive director, and the public interest counsel, who was provided notice as required under Chapter 39 of this title (relating to Public Notice) but who failed to

file timely public comment, failed to file a timely hearing request, failed to participate in the public meeting held under §55.154 of this title (relating to Public Meetings), and failed to participate in the contested case hearing under Chapter 80 of this title (relating to Contested Case Hearings) may file a motion for rehearing under §50.119 of this title (relating to Notice of Commission Action, Motion for Rehearing), or §80.272 of this title (relating to Motion for Rehearing) or may file a motion to overturn the executive director's decision under §50.139 of this title (relating to Motion to Overturn Executive Director's Decision) only to the extent of the changes from the draft permit to the final permit decision.

(i) Applications for which there is no right to a contested case hearing include:

(1) a minor amendment or minor modification of a permit under Chapter 305, Subchapter D of this chapter (relating to Amendments, Renewals, Transfers, Corrections, Revocation, and Suspension of Permits);

(2) a Class 1 or Class 2 modification of a permit under Chapter 305, Subchapter D of this chapter;

(3) any air permit application for the following:

(A) initial issuance of a voluntary emission reduction permit or an electric generating facility permit;

(B) permits issued under Chapter 122 of this title (relating to Federal Operating Permits); or

(C) amendment, modification, or renewal of an air application that would not result in an increase in allowable emissions and would not result in the emission of an air contaminant not previously emitted. The commission may hold a contested case hearing if the application involves a facility for which the applicant's compliance history contains violations which are unresolved and which constitute a recurring pattern of egregious conduct which demonstrates a consistent disregard for the regulatory process, including the failure to make a timely and substantial attempt to correct the violations;

(4) hazardous waste permit renewals under §305.65(a)(8) of this title (relating to Renewal);

(5) an application, under Texas Water Code, Chapter 26, to renew or amend a permit if:

(A) the applicant is not applying to:

(i) increase significantly the quantity of waste authorized to be discharged; or

(ii) change materially the pattern or place of discharge;

(B) the activity to be authorized by the renewal or amended permit will maintain or improve the quality of waste authorized to be discharged;

(C) any required opportunity for public meeting has been given;

(D) consultation and response to all timely received and significant public comment has been given; and

(E) the applicant's compliance history for the previous five years raises no issues regarding the applicant's ability to comply with a material term of the permit; and

(6) other types of applications where a contested case hearing request has been filed but no opportunity for hearing is provided by law.

Adopted September 29, 1999

Effective October 20, 1999

§55.203. Determination of Affected Person.

(a) For any application, an affected person is one who has a personal justiciable interest related to a legal right, duty, privilege, power, or economic interest affected by the application. An interest common to members of the general public does not qualify as a personal justiciable interest.

(b) Governmental entities, including local governments and public agencies, with authority under state law over issues raised by the application may be considered affected persons.

(c) In determining whether a person is an affected person, all factors shall be considered, including, but not limited to, the following:

(1) whether the interest claimed is one protected by the law under which the application will be considered;

(2) distance restrictions or other limitations imposed by law on the affected interest;

(3) whether a reasonable relationship exists between the interest claimed and the activity regulated;

(4) likely impact of the regulated activity on the health and safety of the person, and on the use of property of the person;

(5) likely impact of the regulated activity on use of the impacted natural resource by the person; and

(6) for governmental entities, their statutory authority over or interest in the issues relevant to the application.

Adopted September 29, 1999

Effective October 20, 1999

§55.205. Request by Group or Association.

(a) A group or association may request a contested case hearing only if the group or association meets all of the following requirements:

(1) one or more members of the group or association would otherwise have standing to request a hearing in their own right;

(2) the interests the group or association seeks to protect are germane to the organization's purpose; and

(3) neither the claim asserted nor the relief requested requires the participation of the individual members in the case.

(b) The executive director, the public interest counsel, or the applicant may request that a group or association provide an explanation of how the group or association meets the requirements of subsection (a) of this section. The request and reply shall be filed according to the procedure in §55.209 of this title (relating to Processing Requests for Reconsideration and Contested Case Hearing).

Adopted September 29, 1999

Effective October 20, 1999

§55.209. Processing Requests for Reconsideration and Contested Case Hearing.

(a) This section and §55.211 of this title (relating to Commission Action on Requests for Reconsideration or Contested Case Hearing) apply only to requests for reconsideration and contested case hearing that are timely filed.

(b) After the final deadline to submit requests for reconsideration or contested case hearing, the chief clerk shall process any requests for reconsideration or hearing by both:

(1) referring the application and requests for reconsideration or contested case hearing to the alternative dispute resolution director. The alternative dispute resolution director shall try to resolve any dispute between the applicant and the requestors; and

(2) scheduling the hearing request and request for reconsideration for a commission meeting. However, if only a request for reconsideration is submitted and the commission has delegated its authority to act on the request to the general counsel, the request for reconsideration shall be scheduled for a commission meeting only if the general counsel directs the chief clerk to do so. The chief clerk should try to schedule the requests for a commission meeting that will be held approximately 44 days after the final deadline for timely filed requests for reconsideration or contested case hearing.

(c) The chief clerk shall mail notice to the applicant, executive director, public interest counsel, and all timely commenters and requestors at least 35 days before the first meeting at which the commission considers the requests. The notice shall explain how to participate in the commission decision, describe alternative dispute resolution under commission rules, and explain the relevant requirements of this chapter.

(d) The executive director, the public interest counsel, and the applicant may submit written responses to the requests no later than 23 days before the commission meeting at which the commission will evaluate the requests. Responses shall be filed with the chief clerk, and served on the same day to the executive director, the public interest counsel, the director of the Office of Public Assistance, the applicant, and any requestors.

(e) Responses to hearing requests must specifically address:

- (1) whether the requestor is an affected person;
- (2) which issues raised in the hearing request are disputed;
- (3) whether the dispute involves questions of fact or of law;
- (4) whether the issues were raised during the public comment period;
- (5) whether the hearing request is based on issues raised solely in a public comment withdrawn by the commenter in writing by filing a withdrawal letter with the chief clerk prior to the filing of the Executive Director's Response to Comment;

(6) whether the issues are relevant and material to the decision on the application; and

(7) a maximum expected duration for the contested case hearing.

(f) Responses to requests for reconsideration should address the issues raised in the request.

(g) The requestors may submit written replies to a response no later than nine days before the commission meeting at which the commission will evaluate the request for reconsideration and contested

case hearing. A reply shall be filed with the chief clerk, and served on the same day to the executive director, the public interest counsel, and the applicant.

Adopted December 5, 2001

Effective December 27, 2001

§55.210. Direct Referrals

(a) The executive director or the applicant may file a request with the chief clerk that the application be sent directly to SOAH for a hearing on the application.

(b) After receipt of a request filed under this section and after the executive director has issued his preliminary decision on the application, the chief clerk shall refer the application directly to SOAH for a hearing on whether the application complies with all applicable statutory and regulatory requirements.

(c) A case which has been referred to SOAH under this section shall not be subject to the public meeting requirements of §55.154 of this title (relating to Public Meetings). The agency may, however, call and conduct public meetings in response to public comment. A public meeting is intended for the taking of public comment, and is not a contested case proceeding under the APA. Public meetings held under this section shall be subject to following procedures.

(1) The executive director shall hold a public meeting when there is a significant degree of public interest in a draft permit, or when required by law.

(2) To the extent practicable, the public meeting for any case referred under this section shall be held prior to or on the same date as the preliminary hearing.

(3) Public notice of a public meeting may be abbreviated to facilitate the convening of the public meeting prior to or on the same date as the preliminary hearing, unless the timing of notice is set by statute or a federal regulation governing a permit under a federally authorized program. In any case, public notice must be provided at least ten days before the meeting.

(4) The public comment period shall be extended to the close of any public meeting.

(5) The applicant shall attend any public meeting held.

(6) A tape recording or written transcript of the public meeting shall be filed with the chief clerk and will be included in the chief clerk's case file to be sent to SOAH as provided by §80.6 of this title (relating to Referral to SOAH).

(d) A case which has been referred to SOAH under this section shall be subject to the public comment processing requirements of §55.156(a) and (b)(1) and (3) of this title (relating to Public Comment Processing).

(e) If Notice of Application and Preliminary Decision is provided at or after direct referral under this section, this notice shall include, in lieu of the information required by §39.411(c) of this title (relating to Text of Public Notice), the following:

(1) the information required by §39.411(b)(1) - (3), (4)(A), (6) - (9), (10)(A), (B)(i) - (iii), and (C) - (D), (11), (12), and (14) of this title;

(2) the information required by §39.411(c)(4) and (5) of this title; and

(3) a brief description of public comment procedures, including a description of the manner in which comments regarding the executive director's preliminary decision may be submitted, the deadline to file public comments or request a public meeting, and a statement that a public meeting will be held by the executive director if there is significant public interest in the proposed activity. These public comment procedures must be printed in a font style or size that clearly provides emphasis and distinguishes it from the remainder of the notice.

Adopted December 5, 2001

Effective December 27, 2001

§55.211. Commission Action on Requests for Reconsideration and Contested Case Hearing.

(a) Commission consideration of the following items is not itself a contested case subject to the APA:

- (1) public comment;
- (2) executive director's response to comment;
- (3) request for reconsideration; or
- (4) request for contested case hearing.

(b) The commission will evaluate public comment, executive director's response to comment, requests for reconsideration, and requests for contested case hearing and may:

- (1) grant or deny the request for reconsideration;
- (2) determine that a hearing request does not meet the requirements of this subchapter, and act on the application; or
- (3) determine that a hearing request meets the requirements of this subchapter and:

(A) if the request raises disputed issues of fact that were raised during the comment period, that were not withdrawn by the commenter in writing by filing a withdrawal letter with the chief clerk prior to the filing of the Executive Director's Response to Comment, and that are relevant and material to the commission's decision on the application:

(i) specify the number and scope of the specific factual issues to be referred to SOAH;

(ii) specify the maximum expected duration of the hearing; and

(iii) direct the chief clerk to refer the issues to SOAH for a hearing; or

(B) if the request raises only disputed issues of law or policy, make a decision on the issues and act on the application; or

(4) direct the chief clerk to refer the hearing request to SOAH. The referral may specify that SOAH should prepare a recommendation on the sole question of whether the requestor is an affected person. If the commission refers the hearing request to SOAH it shall be processed as a contested case under the APA. If the commission determines that a requestor is an affected person, SOAH may proceed with a contested case hearing on the application if either the commission has specified, or the parties have agreed to, the number and scope of the issues and maximum expected duration of the hearing.

(c) A request for a contested case hearing shall be granted if the request is:

(1) made by the applicant or the executive director;

(2) made by an affected person if the request:

(A) raises disputed issues of fact that were raised during the comment period, that were not withdrawn by the commenter by filing a withdrawal letter with the chief clerk prior to the filing of the executive director's response to comment, and that are relevant and material to the commission's decision on the application;

(B) is timely filed with the chief clerk;

(C) is pursuant to a right to hearing authorized by law; and

(D) complies with the requirements of §55.201 of this title (relating to Requests for Reconsideration or Contested Case Hearing).

(d) Notwithstanding any other commission rules, the commission may refer an application to SOAH if the commission determines that:

(1) a hearing would be in the public interest; or

(2) the application is for an amendment, modification, or renewal of an air permit under Texas Health and Safety Code, §382.0518 or §382.055 that involves a facility for which the applicant's compliance history contains violations which are unresolved and which constitute a recurring pattern of egregious conduct which demonstrates a consistent disregard for the regulatory process, including the failure to make a timely and substantial attempt to correct the violations.

(3) the application is for renewal of a hazardous waste permit, subject to §305.65(a)(8) of this title (relating to Renewal) and the applicant's compliance history as determined under Chapter 60 of this title (relating to Compliance History) raises an issue regarding the applicant's ability to comply with a material term of its permit.

(4) the application is for renewal or amendment of a wastewater discharge permit and the applicant's compliance history as determined under Chapter 60 of this title raises an issue regarding the applicant's ability to comply with a material term of its permit.

(e) If a request for a contested case hearing is granted, a decision on a request for reconsideration or contested case hearing is an interlocutory decision on the validity of the request or issue and is not binding on the issue of designation of parties under §80.109 of this title (relating to Designation of Parties) or the issues referred to SOAH under this section. A judge may consider additional issues beyond the list referred by the commission as provided by §80.4(c)(16) of this title (relating to Judges). A person whose request for reconsideration or contested case hearing is denied may still seek to be admitted as a party under §80.109 of this title if any hearing request is granted on an application. Failure to seek party status shall be deemed a withdrawal of a person's request for reconsideration or hearing request.

(f) If all requests for reconsideration or contested case hearing are denied, §80.272 of this title (relating to Motion for Rehearing) applies. A motion for rehearing in such a case must be filed no more than 20 days after the date the person or attorney of record is notified of the commission's final decision or order. A person is presumed to have been notified on the third day after the date that the decision or order is mailed by first class mail. If the motion is denied under §80.272 and §80.273 of this title (relating to Motion for Rehearing and Decision Final and Appealable) the commission's decision is final and appealable under Texas Water Code, §5.351 or Texas Health and Safety Code, §361.321 or §382.032, or under the APA.

(g) If all hearing requestors whose requests for a contested case hearing were granted with regard to an issue, withdraw in writing their hearing requests with regard to the issue before issuance of the notice of the contested case hearing, the scope of the hearing no longer includes that issue except as authorized under §80.4(c)(16) of this title.

Adopted August 7, 2002

Effective August 29, 2002